

<p>张艺谋电影与中国当代小说：从文学时代到影像时代的变迁</p> <p>苏七七</p> <p>从1987年的《红高粱》到2006年的《满城尽带黄金甲》，二十年间，张艺谋一直是中国最重要的电影导演。诚如在文学史会对“好作家”与“重要作家”进行区分一样，张艺谋的电影作品，评论或誉或毁，但就其重要性而言，却是毋庸置疑的。这种重要性，不仅在于它的美学风格与成绩，而在于它与意识形态及文化潮流之间的共生关系——它是某个社会阶段的文化产品，同时是它的症候与构成。也因此，探讨张艺谋电影与中国当代小说的关系，重点不在于这种“改编”的成功与否，而且在于改编的内容，改编的取舍，以及最后对于改编的放弃里，折射出了怎样的媒介型态与社会型态的变化——并且进而思考这样一个问题：当影像时代与消费时代来临的时候，电影与文学之间怎样能形成一个良性关系，在思想与美学上互相启发。</p> <p>从这个角度上说，张艺谋是一个反面例子。如果把他的电影作品大体上分为三个时期：</p> <p>早期：《红高粱》（1987）——《活着》（1994）</p> <p>中期：《摇啊摇，摇到外婆桥》（1995）——《幸福时光》（1999）</p> <p>近期：《英雄》（2001）——《满城尽带黄金甲》（2007）</p>	<p>Zhang Yimou's Movies and Contemporary Chinese Novels: A Transition from the Literature Age to the Image Age</p> <p>Su Qiqi</p> <p>From <i>Red Sorghum</i> (1987) to <i>Curse of the Golden Flower</i> (2006), Zhang Yimou has maintained his place as the most important film director for two decades. In the same way as that “a good writer” is distinguished from “an important writer” in literature history, Zhang Yimou's movies brought him both applauses and criticism, but there has never been doubt about their significance. It lies not only in its aesthetic style and achievements, but also in the symbiotic relationship between ideology and cultural trend—it represents the cultural product of a certain social stage plus its features and composition. For this reason, a research into the relationship between Zhang's movies and the contemporary Chinese novels does not focus on whether it is a successful “adaptation”, but on how the adaptation has reflected the changes in media form and social form. It then may be pondered further on how to create a virtuous relationship between movie and literature in a time of image and consumption so that they can inspire each other ideologically and aesthetically.</p> <p>From this viewpoint Zhang Yimou is a negative example. If his movies are categorized into three periods:</p> <p>Early period: <i>Red Sorghum</i>(1987)—<i>To Live</i>(1994)</p> <p>Middle period: <i>Shanghai Triad</i> (1995) --<i>Happy Times</i></p> <p>Recent: <i>Hero</i>(2001)-- <i>Curse of the Golden Flower</i>(2007)</p>
--	---

很明显可以看到，张艺谋的早期作品几乎全部改编自 80 年代中期到 90 年代初期的当代文学作品，莫言，苏童，刘恒，余华这些重要小说家的代表作；从《摇啊摇，摇到外婆桥》开始，他依然是中国文学期刊的一大订户，但电影的原著小说，往往是不太知名的作家作品了，这些作品在当代文学史上都算不上重要作品；最后，自《英雄》开始的古装武侠大片，与当代小说没有任何关系，《满城尽带黄金甲》回到一个现代戏剧名著中去取材。

这条极其明显的渐行渐远的轨迹，是张艺谋的选择，也能从中看到整个社会的文化潮流变迁，张艺谋总是能紧跟时代的潮流，同时也站在潮头成为最醒目的标志。他有他的机敏，但缺乏反思，他有他的幽默，但缺乏反讽，他的形式主义是他的风格所在，而这种形式的最高成就，是不自觉地成为时代状况的同构。——离开了文学，张艺谋电影的美学水准不见得下降了，但电影中的思想和倾向，成为引起争议的焦点。

—

《红高粱》改编自莫言同名小说，《大红灯笼高高挂》改编自苏童《妻妾成群》，《菊豆》改编自刘恒《伏羲伏羲》，《秋菊打官司》改编自陈源斌《万家诉讼》，《活着》改编自余华同名小说。——《红高粱》获得了柏林电影节金熊奖，《活着》获戛纳电影节评审奖，在张艺谋电影与当代小说的蜜月期

It would be clear that almost all his early movies were adapted from the contemporary literary works of mid 1980's to early 1990's, for instance, the representative works of such major novelists as Mo Yan, Su Tong, Liu Heng and Yu Hua. Starting from *Shanghai Triad*, he remained a big subscriber for Chinese literary periodicals, but the originals for his movies, mainly by less-known writers, were not held as major works in the contemporary literature history. Later on, blockbusters featuring traditional Chinese costume and martial arts starting from *Hero* had nothing to do with the contemporary novels, with *Curse of the Golden Flower* modelled on a masterpiece of modern drama.

Zhang Yimou's choice to depart from literature reflects a change of cultural trend in the society as a whole. He can always keep up with the times, riding on the tide as the most eye-catching symbol. He is quick-witted but not reflective; he is humorous but not ironic. His style lies in his formalism which in the natural course of events forms isomorphism to the circumstances of the times when it reaches its prime. The absence of literature in Zhang's movies does not necessarily mean a degraded aesthetic standard, though the ideology and philosophy conveyed have become a focus of controversy.

ONE

Red Sorghum is adapted from the novel of the same title by Mo Yan, *Raise the Red Lantern* from *Wives and Concubines* by Su Tong, *Ju Dou* from *Fu Xi Fu Xi* by Liu Heng, *The Story of Qiu Ju* from *The Wan Family's Lawsuit* by Chen Yuan Bin, *To Live* from the novel of the same title by Yu Hua. During the honeymoon of his movies with the contemporary novels, Zhang

里，他的起步就是高峰，然后以一系列加强与加深类似主题的作品，建立了一个张艺谋电影世界。

这一系列电影的成就，一方面在于张艺谋在电影语言上的天赋与创新，莫言，苏童，刘恒的文字风格相去极远，但《红高粱》，《大红灯笼高高挂》与《菊豆》，却都是鲜明的，有强烈视觉冲击力的张艺谋风格。从小说到电影，张艺谋最重要的贡献是突出了空间与人物之间的关系，《大红灯笼高高挂》中的大院，《菊豆》中的染坊，都是封闭式构图中的封闭式空间，直接地达成感官冲击与象征性——也就是说，张艺谋绝不是微妙细腻的，他把原作中很多的精微之处都抹去了，但是直接，大胆，不那么依赖于情感逻辑，而通过视觉感受来引发共鸣与理解。这种较为粗鄙的方式当然也容易流于简化，比如《英雄》的结尾，不但无法共鸣，反而引发了大片的质疑之声。而小说对于电影的贡献就是：虽然张艺谋对小说的背景，细节有所取舍，却依然保持了基本的情节构架。应当说，这些八九十年最优秀的文学作品，都有一个好“故事”，这些故事溢出了原来的宏大叙事体系，寻找不同寻常的场景与角度，事实上是从文学的角度，省视历史与人性，而隐含的指向，则是一个现代社会在中国出现的可能。

这些小说，可以汇入 80 年代的文学大潮的波涛之中，所谓寻根文学，担负的还是启蒙功能。即是在社会的转

made unparalleled achievements with *Red Sorghum* awarded Golden Bear in the Berlin International Film Festival and *To Live* winning the Grand Jury Prize in the Cannes International Film Festival, then he went further to create a world of his own films by production of a series of works of similar or strengthened themes.

Such achievements may to some extent attribute to Zhang's gifted and creative usages of movie language. Despite the divided literary style of Mo Yan, Su Tong, and Liu Heng, *Red Sorghum*, *Raise the Red Lantern*, *Ju Dou* all stand out by their distinctive Zhang Yimou style characterized by emphatic visual effect. From novel to film, Zhang's greatest contribution is his highlight of relationship between space and characters, for instance, the courtyard in *Raise the Red Lantern*, the dye house in *Ju Dou*, all being closed space in a closed composition, resulting in a direct visual and symbolic effects. That is to say, in a style of non-subtlety, he abandoned many details in the originals, but aimed to arouse in the audience resonance and understanding by direct and bold visual images rather than reliance on emotional depiction. However the film thus produced may be likely to be too simplified, as illustrated by the ending of *Hero*, which not only failed to pull at the audience's heartstrings but also aroused popular questioning about it. The novel contributes its basic plot to the movie though Zhang made alterations to its background and details. It ought to be noted that these outstanding literary works of the 1980's and 1990's all tell a good "story", which, if put into an unusual setting and seen from a different perspective, may in effect offer a view on history and humanity in literature, implying the possibility of the emergence of a modern Chinese society .

These novels were all caught up in the literary trend of the 1980's. The so called root-finding literature functions as an enlightening tool. By

型之中，通过对性（《红高粱》、《妻妾成群》、《伏羲伏羲》）与人性（《活着》）的“寻根”，启蒙着一种个体的肉体生存与精神生存的复苏——一个体的生存是必然的，多元的，从而对群体大于个体的叙事，进行非正面的反击。诸多寻根文学，例如《红高粱》，将背景设定在爷爷奶奶这一辈，正是因为年代上恰可避开解放后一段的叙事禁区，在抗日这一传统的革命叙事里旧瓶装上新酒。

第五代导演的电影正好汇入了这股大潮之中，成为思想解放潮流中的一股支流，《黄土地》，《盗马贼》，都很寻根，很启蒙。但当时的电影相对于文学还是弱势，一个原因是市场经济与消费时代尚未到来，另一个原因是影像时代还处于初始阶段。当二者在二十年间迅速发展，纯文学小说成为小众与边缘时，张艺谋的电影又紧追时代的主流去了，——从这个角度说，分手是势所必然。

而张艺谋电影与当代小说的这段蜜月期，恰恰是在一个诗歌和小说可以成为大众读物的时代，物质虽然不丰裕，文化产品也没有成为消费品，依然担当着启蒙者的重任。计划经济体系尚未解体，电影拍摄的资金有制片厂解决，票房也不成为压力。——对于第五代导演来说，资金不是最重要，最迫切的问题，最重要的是电影的思想水平与艺术表现力，是来自国际电影节的认可。因此，在80年代第五代电影风起云涌的时候，他们实际上在历史的夹缝中，遇到了一个最好的拍摄艺术电影的时机：原本小众

“searching the roots” of sex (*Red Sorghum*, *Wives and Concubines*, *Fu Xi Fu Xi*) and human nature (*To Live*) in the social transitional period, enlightenment on physical and spiritual existence of individuals was brought into new life. As an individual's existence is necessary and multiple, preference of narration of a group over an individual was indirectly criticized. Many a root-finding literary works, *Red Sorghum* for instance, took the grandparent's generation as their backdrop, for, this way they could avoid the hot waters of the post-liberation period, and return to the old traditional anti-Japanese War story for something new.

The movies of the fifth generation directors happened to join this trend, turning to be a branch in the ideological emancipation. *Yellow Earth* and *Horse Thief* are both enlightening and root-searching. However film industry were relatively weaker compared with literature field, for one thing the market economy and the time of consumption had not yet arrived, and for another a time of image were still in its infancy. When pure literature was marginalized by the rapid growth of the above factors, Zhang's movies once again followed upon the heels of the main trend of the times. Therefore the break-up of the two naturally ensued.

The honeymoon of Zhang's movies and the contemporary novels witnessed a time of less abundance and cultural product consumption when poetry together with novels could boast a wide readership, assuming the main task as enlighteners. Under the planned economy, funds for film-making were provided by the film studio, and box office performance was not a concern. For the fifth generation directors, they cared more about a film's ideological and artistic expressiveness, in particular recognition by international film festivals, rather than the funds. In the 1980's when the fifth generation movies prospered, golden opportunities to shoot

的艺术电影与纯文学作品一起,参与并成为了大众思想解放潮流的一部分。

回顾张艺谋这一时期的电影作品,基本都上保持了一个较高的水准。《红高粱》、《大红灯笼高高挂》与《菊豆》中各种民族与民俗元素构成的视觉奇观,提供了一条与“全球”与“本土”之间的沟通捷径,通过这种技巧性的“观看”关系,张艺谋顺利地登上了国际影坛。——但他的能力,在于使这种“观看”不仅仅只是关系,本身还有其审美价值。而且对于这几部电影来说,除了表层的民俗或伪民俗,它们的核心情节依旧是一个强大的在破旧立新的启蒙故事,力比多所释放或压抑的能量,试图对抗一个封闭性的旧体系,寻找与建构有生命力的个体。虽然新的世界在这些电影中尚未出场,但这些统统以死亡结局的故事外,有整个社会文化对某种新状态的准备与期待。社会文化的新潮流,电影的新潮流,乃至开始电影生涯不久的张艺谋(以及巩俐),同时地都具有一种新鲜冒险的气象与力量,当一个艺术家在一个整体性的潮流中显示了自身的艺术天赋与操作能力时,他也势必成为一个代表人物。

在抗日与反封建这样的主流意识形态宏大叙事体系之中,夹带进个人叙事,是新历史小说与张艺谋电影在这一阶段的共同行为方式。但与小说比较起来,张艺谋显然要更保守一些。在莫言的小说里,对已有革命叙事的直接抵触之处在电影中基本上不见了(余占魁与冷支队长的冲突被省

art films in the crack of history presented themselves: the combination of minority-appealing art films with pure literary works played a role in the ideological emancipation of the masses.

Zhang Yimou's movies in this period were generally of a high standard. In *Red Sorghum*, *Raise the Red Lantern*, *Ju Dou*, a number of ethnic and folk custom factors worked a visual wonder, paving a shortcut for communication between "the world" and "the local China." Zhang's "perception" of relationship elevated him to the international film arena. He proved his ability in that the "perception" not only reflected relationship but also had aesthetic merits by itself. These films, apart from the folk-custom or fake lore on the surface, were based on enlightening stories with their main plot revolving the destruction of something old and creation of something new, in which energy released or repressed by libido attempted to counteract the old closed system so as to achieve live individuation. Though a new world had not emerged from these films, in these stories where death came as an end, the whole social culture got prepared for and looked forward to a new state to come out. The new trend of social culture and of films, and even Zhang Yimou (and Gong Li) who had not embarked on his film career for long, all demonstrated pioneering spirit and power. And when an artist displayed his artistic endowment in practice, he would certainly be a representative of the trend.

Zhang's films at this stage coincided with new historical novels in that they all had narration of individual stories inserted in the grand ideological context of anti-Japanese war and anti-feudalism. But obviously Zhang's movies appeared more conservative than novels. Direct conflicts depicted in Mo Yan's novel were basically absent from the film (Yu Zhankui's

略,只保留了余占魁与日本鬼子的冲突),莫言的小说结尾一直写到1976年,绝不是一个英雄主义的结尾,而电影结束在战斗之中,是一个相当混乱的结尾。——在高蹈的激情与壮烈的悲剧中,夹杂着一些闹剧性的成分,战火声中混杂的吹号声,临时出了问题的枪炮,都使这场悲剧的悲壮性大大减少。这些人为国而死,但是死得并不是非常英雄。导演对气氛的把握似乎有些矛盾:到论底是抒写一曲悲歌呢,还是保存这曲悲歌中的一些不协调的音调。最后他是折衷的:保留了一些可笑的成分,但在最后还是给了一个最传统的英雄式的仰角镜头,红高粱在风中呜咽。

这是张艺谋的问题所在:他意识得到什么东西是有艺术价值的(艺术意味着对于边界的拓展,对于程式化的感受与表达的扬弃),但是他还是选择了取巧的、甚至取悦的思想与表达方式。在早期的三部非当代题材的代表电影之后,张艺谋拍了《秋菊打官司》,改编自陈源斌的小说《万家诉讼》,这篇小说当年在《小说月报》头条发表,然后头条转载于《中篇小说选刊》、《新华文摘》。陈源斌长于写法制题材,这篇小说就其情节与语言有其可取之处,但归结到底,还是一个非常主旋律的农妇上访的故事。张艺谋基本上照用了小说的情节,突出了纪录风格与女主人公的个性特征,应当说,电影比小说更好些,饱满亮丽,节奏与细节都很利落。但是在这个“成功”的电影里,恰恰隐藏了张艺谋所要面对的拍摄当代题材的问题:手法是纪实的(例如偷拍),但他镜头下温情丰裕的图景,的确是当代中国的纪实?女主人公依旧是强悍的,“一根筋”的,但性的问题即便还作为电影的叙事核心,却不是情节逻辑的原动力——“一根筋”只

conflict with detachment head Leng was left out, but his conflict with the Japanese soldiers remained in the film). Mo Yan's novel proceeded until 1976 with a none-heroism ending while the film ended up in a chaotic battle. In the passionate and tragic scene, some farcical factors popped up, clarion calls amid the misfiring of guns and grenades greatly reduced its tragic nature. They died for their country, but they did not die a hero's death. The director seemed in a dilemma as to what atmosphere he should create: to compose a complete tragedy, or to add some inharmonious tone into it? At last he accepted a compromise to keep some laughable elements while in a traditional low-angle shot portraying the red sorghums whimpering in the wind for the heroes.

This is what Zhang's point lies: he was aware about what could carry artistic value (art means extension of boundary and discard of stereotyped expression), but nonetheless he conveyed his ideas by an ingenious, even pleasing method. Following three representative movies of non-contemporary theme in his early directing period, Zhang shot *The Story of Qu Ju* adapted from *The Wan Family's Lawsuit*, a novel by Chen Yubin, which was published in *Fiction Monthly* before it was reprinted in *Selected Novelettes* and *Xinhua Digest*. Chen Yuanbin is known for his legal theme writings. This novel, though desirable with regard to its plot and language, in essence centers round a farmwife's lawsuit story. Zhang Yimou almost copied its entire plot, but highlighted its documentary style and individuality of its protagonist. The film is considered better than the novel with its lush colors, light rhythm. Yet underlying his “success” of the film was a problem that Zhang had to confront in dealing with contemporary themes: the secret shooting technique was applied, but did the heart-warming scenes seen through his camera reflect the real contemporary China? The

是用来支撑情节发展的性格特征,可以构成一个性格喜剧,而无法启发与解决普泛性的问题,在《一个都不能多》里,这一叙事问题还在继续发展。

《秋菊打官司》的缺陷,在小说中也有存在,但张艺谋往往能从小说的细节中变化出漂亮的画面,却很难在思想上比小说更高一筹。他最好的电影作品,是他最忠实于一个优秀小说的思想内涵的作品,《活着》。虽然在情节上,电影对小说有相当大的改动——取消了小说的双重叙事框架,并只改编了小说的前半部,但电影保留了一种诚恳地面对历史与现实的态度。小说中所发掘的人性之美,通过镜头语言与表演,得到了更为质朴直接的表现。人物的生命力,建立在福贵式的,不过分去反省生命意义而保持着对日常生活的坚定维持上,而最终慰藉,来自于家珍式的,不管面对的是什么样的历史语境始终不泯灭的善良坚韧。

《活着》是张艺谋的一部好作品,但却是最不“张艺谋”的一部作品。他的形式主义爱好,在这部电影里被一种来自原作的态度影响了:没有将对象呈现为一种固定形式,就形式达成简易的理解,而是试图深入到对象的核心,从而考查整个语境与历史。

woman protagonist is valiant and “one-track minded”. Sex may be in the center of storytelling in the film, but it cannot be the motive force driving the development of the plot. “One-track mindedness”, the distinctive character of the protagonist to support the plot, may lend itself to a comedy of character, but cannot inspire or resolve a universal question. In *Not One Less*, the problem in narration continued to exist.

Defects in *The Story of Qiu Ju* can also be found in the novel. Often Zhang Yimou can transform minutiae in novel into beautiful pictures in movie, but finds it difficult to be ideologically more superior. His best film, *To Live*, turns to be most loyal to the ideology of the excellent novel, though he made alterations to the plot—having abandoned its dual narrative structure and only adapted the first half of the novel. But he adopted the novel’s attitude of treating history and reality honestly. The beauty of human nature revealed in the novel exhibits itself in a more direct and clearer way through lens language and actor’s performance. The vital force of the protagonist springs from Fugui who carries on his daily life with determination rather than meditate too much on the meaning of life. A sense of consolation may be attributed to Jiazhen who demonstrates inextinguishable goodness and tenacity in whatever historical context.

To Live falls into the good works of Zhang Yimou, but not the most typical Zhang’s. His preference on formalism was somewhat influenced by the attitude conveyed in the original novel, resulting in his failure to present his objects in a fixed form to make it easily understandable, rather, he made attempts to penetrate into the core of the object so as to examine the whole context and history.

二

《活着》在艺术上的成功并不意味着它在现实语境中的成功。90年代中期,整个第五代导演都拿出了他们最好的作品,同时开始“转型”。陈凯歌拍了《霸王别姬》,田壮壮拍了《蓝风筝》,连同《活着》,这几部作品都不约而同地开始涉及到建国后的当代状况,——启蒙主义叙事把场景设置在过去,在边缘,但“当代”却是一个互补性的隐含他者,并且挣扎显形。也许沿着这个方向走下去,当代电影能够出现真正立足于当代生活的杰作,但这个方向上却路障累累,一个接一个是“此路不通”的标志。

首先,主导意识形态不允许这样的电影出现在电影院。余华的小说不是禁书,但张艺谋的电影是禁片,因为大众媒体的影响远不止于知识分子阶层,受到的管制要严厉得多。张艺谋忽然发现,他不再是能兼得金狮奖与百花奖的“双赢”导演,也有可能被抛向田壮壮式的边缘位置。其次,计划经济时代结束了,《活着》的投资方不再是省级电影制片厂,而是香港年代电影公司——电影不能公映,没有票房,如何向投资方交待?一个双重困境摆在了张艺谋的面前。一方面是对当代题材的电检限制,一方面是影像时代来临了,同时消费社会也来临了,市场成了对导演的考验。

TWO

The success of *To Live* artistically did not necessarily mean a success in the context of reality. In the mid 1990's, the whole body of fifth generation directors came up with their best works and began their “transition”. *Farewell My Concubine* by Chen Kaige, *The Blue Kite* by Tian Zhuangzhuang, together with *To Live*, coincidentally touched upon the contemporary society after the founding of the PRC. In enlightening narration the scenes were set in the past, on the edge, but “contemporary” itself managed to show its true figures as a connotation. Perhaps in this direction there could possibly appear a contemporary film masterpiece truly based on the contemporary social life, but it would not be a smooth road as blocks and signs reading “not passable” may be encountered one by one.

First of all, such films were prohibited from staging in cinemas by the dominant ideology. Unlike Yu Hua's novel, Zhang's film was given a ban, for the mass media came under stricter supervision due to its wider influence on the public rather than on intellectuals alone. Zhang suddenly found out that he was no long the “double winner” of both the Golden Lion and Hundred Flowers and that he could be marginalized like Tian Zhuangzhuang. Secondly, as the planned economy had come to an end, *To Live* was financed by ERA International (HK) Ltd, instead of a provincial film studio. If the film could not be on public show or perform badly in terms of box office, how could he face his investors? He was caught up in such a dilemma: on the one hand, censorship on the contemporary theme films is in place, on the other, directors have to face the test of market in a time of image and consumption society.

时至 90 年代中期，中国的文化大潮退潮，经济大潮涨潮。文学不再占据历史的中心位置，而有趣的是，张艺谋也不再选择那些重要作家，重要作品作为他的改编依据。在电影与原著作品之间，大体上有这要的对应关系：商业电影改编自通俗文学、畅销书，艺术电影改编自名著，纯文学作品，具有中国特色的主旋律电影改编自报告文学或者主旋律小说。文化大潮一退，艺术电影与纯文学作品共同弄潮的美好时光一去不返，张艺谋的第二个创作阶段，不再与当代的一线作家联手，他开始拍商业电影，以及具备商业价值的类主旋律电影。

改编自李晓《门规》的《摇啊摇，摇到外婆桥》显然是张艺谋试水之初的一个失败之作：他赶着对三十年代的怀旧风，却没有掌握类型片的要素特征。在一个文艺片与一个黑帮片间摇摆不定，只能说明他还不是一个成熟的商业片导演。接下来的几部电影，都改编自一些不知名的作品：《有话好好说》改编自述平的《晚报新闻》，《我的父亲母亲》改编自鲍十的《纪念》，《一个也不能少》改编自施祥生《天上有个太阳》，唯一一部改编自莫言小说的，也是莫言小说中很不起眼一个《师傅越来越幽默》。

这一阶段的改编，较之前一阶段，已经有了一个明显的不同：第一阶段的作品改编，基本还是“忠实原著”的，情节的主干线没有变化，但第二阶段的电影中，原著的影子已经很模糊。张艺谋作为一个“著名导演”，相对

In the mid 1990's, as the cultural trend gave way to economic development in China, literature was no longer in the spotlight of history. Interestingly, Zhang Yimou ceased to select those major works by prominent writers for adaptation. Between a film and the original, there is a rough correlation: commercial films are usually adapted from popular literature or best-selling books, art films from masterpieces or pure literature, "main-melody" films of Chinese characteristics from reportages or "main-melody" novels. After cultural tide receded, gone was the happy time for collaboration between art films and pure literature. Zhang Yimou, in his second period of creation, did not join hands with the best contemporary writers any more, but began to shoot commercial films and quasi-main-melody films of commercial value.

Shanghai Triad adapted from *Gang Law* by Li Xiao is obviously a failure for Zhang after he took his first plunge into the market. He followed the trend of reminiscence of the 1930's, but he did not master the main elements for a genre film. Pendulous between an art film and a gangster film, he had not yet grown up to be a mature commercial film director. His next array of films were all adapted from works of less-known writers: *Keep Cool* from *Evening Papers News* by Shu Ping, *The Road Home*; *My Father and Mother* from *Remembrance* by Bao Shi, *Not One Less* from *The Sun in the Sky* by Shi Xiangsheng, except *Happy Times* from a petty novel *Shifu: You'll Do Anything for a Laugh* by Mo Yan.

The adaptation in the second period differed a lot from that in his previous period. In the first he basically adhered to the original without making great alterations to the main plot, while in the second it was hard to recognise the original. Zhang Yimou, as a "famous director",

于这些不太著名的作家,显然有更大的发言权。作家成为任他差遣的编剧,服从他的电影的需要,在原著小说与电影之间,已经没有了平等对话的气氛,而是一种服务式的关系。“遇到张艺谋这样的导演我很幸运”的莫言说:“写小说时我是一个皇帝,而改编剧本时是一个奴才。”当电影作为强势文化产品,意味着能给原著小说带来极其可观的销售与名气上涨时,这些作者也多数乐于成为张艺谋的编剧。莫言尝试在这种情况下保持一种“作者”的独立与尊严时,这样分清二者的关系:“小说跟电影、电视剧的关系,我认为应该是各走各的路,然后偶然地在某一点上契合,生出一个产品。”(1)

在这些原著小说里,张艺谋多半也只要找到一两个他感兴趣的点,然后根据他的意思另外重写——其实他自己是编剧组中最重要的一个。不能说张艺谋的眼光不敏锐,也不能说他的改编不成功。事实上,他往往能抓住原作中最具备情节力度和视觉效果的节点,但是这些小说几乎没有一部对当代生活有足够广度与深度的写照,——它们刚好吻合了张艺谋某一阶段的思路,或者仅仅具备一个灵巧合意的结构乃至场景设置。这些小说的起点本身不高,张艺谋也没有为它们增加高度,他只是把他感兴趣的方用他的形式与风格来处理,因此常常在视觉上尚有可取之处,逻辑却往往贫弱。比如他自己认为是个好作品的《一个都不能少》:结尾用大众媒体的关注来解决了一个小学校的问题,但这种解决方案是缺乏普泛可行性的。不是每一个小学校都有一个“一根筋”的魏敏芝(她之所以坚持

evidently had a greater say than those less-known writers. When those writers had become screenwriters at his beck and call to serve his film, the original could not talk with the film on an equal footing any more. In Mo Yan's words, "I am fortunate to have met a director like Zhang Yimou. I was an emperor when I wrote the novel, but I turned a servant when I adapted it into a screenplay." The reason why they were willing to act as Zhang's screenwriters was that, movie as a powerful cultural product could considerably promote sales and reputation of the original. Mo Yan, in an attempt to maintain his independence and dignity as a "writer" under such circumstances, described the relationship between the two, "With regard to the relationship between a novel and the film or TV play, in my view they should take their own courses, but when they join together at some point by accident, a new product will come into being." (1)

Most often Zhang Yimou would look in the original novel for a point or two that he was interested in, which would be developed into a new story in conformity with his own idea—in fact Zhang himself played the most important role among screenwriters. It is not a matter of his lack of a sharp eye or failure of adaptation. Actually he was able to seize a point in the original where the plot and visual effects produced could make a perfect match. The question is that none of these novels provide a full reflection of the contemporary life both in scope and in depth. They merely happened to coincide with Zhang's intention at that time, or to provide him with a structure or setting to his liking. The novels did not have a high starting point, and Zhang did not mean to elevate them. By merely giving a form and style of his own to what he was interested in in the original, he produced a film visually desirable but logically weak. For instance, in the end of *Not One Less*, referred to by him as one of his best films, he

“一个都不能少”的前提也是偶然的),也不是每个孩子的走失都能得到电视台的关注。当然,大众媒体的介入是件好事,它能够树立典型事件与典型人物,加深大众对教育问题的关注度与参与度,但它不是一个可能从根本上解决这个问题的主体。当将最后的希望孤注一掷地搁在大众媒体上时,并且展现出乐观的心态时,这种希望就显得华而不实。张艺谋的问题,在于他把这个问题处理得太轻省了,他非常迅速地把这个问题的严酷性给滑过去,而给出了一个轻巧的答案。

这种轻巧的态度再走远一步,就变成《幸福时光》式的虚假。莫言的小说《师傅越来越幽默》是一个黑色幽默,小说里,老工人在临退休时被下岗,在公园边用一个废弃公交车开了一个情人旅馆供人寻欢作乐,他也好安度晚年,可是有一天却有一对男女在里头出了事。——黑色幽默之所以黑色,就是要沿着当代生活的逻辑一步步推进,最后落入一个无法脱身的悲凉荒谬的困境。而张艺谋只看中了小说中的一个元素:公交车改装的情人旅馆。影片的开头,虽然是在一种闹剧的风格中开始,但还是看得出人生的艰辛底子。但导演没有把这种幽默处理得更更有厚度,而是把它低俗化、表象化了。接着的情节更完全抛开了原著小说,变成发生在老工人与盲女之间温情脉脉的故事。——弱势群体只能是在彼此的善意欺骗中,维持着一个人间充满爱的悲剧吗?——如果这是一个答案,那么这种答案也不失为一种理解。但是张艺谋的问题,在于他连这一个答案也不能承

left the resolution of the problems of the school to the mass media attention, which certainly cannot find universal application. Not every school has a “one-track minded” Wei Minzhi (whose insistence on “not one less” was based on an incidental premise), and not every student getting lost will receive attention from the TV media. Indeed, it is a good thing to obtain intervention from the mass media that can help establish typical case and characters so as to enhance public awareness and participation in educational affairs, but who at the same time cannot be taken as the main body to solve the problems. When one places all his hope on the mass media alone in optimism, his hope may end up nowhere at all. With Zhang Yimou. He treated the problem too lightly, and having turned a blind eye to the severity of the problem he gave an easy solution.

A step further from this light attitude led to unreality in *Happy Times*. The novel *Shifu: You'll Do Anything for a Laugh* by Mo Yan is a black humour. In the novel, an old factory worker laid out before retirement turns a broken bus into a lovers' hotel by a park for willing couples to dwell in so that he can make a living for the rest of his life, but one day a strange thing happens to a couple staying in the hotel. Black humour is black in that it will finally get into a sad and absurd plight following the logic of contemporary life. But what Zhang took interest in is one element—the lovers' hotel transformed from a bus. Despite a farce at the beginning of the film, audience still can have a taste of hardships in life. However Zhang stopped probing deeper into the meaning of this humour, and gave it a vulgar and shallow presentation. Next diverging completely from the novel, the film tells a moving story between the old worker and the blind girl.—the vulnerable group can only find love under heaven out of good-will deception in a tragedy?—if this is an answer, it is also an

担，他在现实与想象、直面与谎言中进退维谷，而只能通过插科打诨中取得暂时的缓解（这个片子，连幽默都是很生造的）。

莫言的这个小说比较潦草，不是他的代表作的水平，但是也没有跌出这个作家的底线，有起码准确的对生活的描述与理解，而张艺谋的电影，如果还可以称之为改编的话，几乎完全是一种“误读”。他扭转这个黑色幽默的方向，试图把它变为温婉的含泪一笑，却暴露了在面对现实题材时最无力与软弱的地方。

三

在与当代小说合作的蜜月期里，张艺谋曾经说过：“中国有一个庞大的作家群，我喜欢的作家很多，像莫言、刘恒、苏童、王朔这几位我所合作过的作家，我都很喜欢。他们的作品作为我的电影的文学母体，在表现文学走向的同时也引导了电影的走向，所以你要看中国电影的发展或者我个人风格的演变，可以看作作家们将来的变化。”“我们研究中国当代电影，首先要研究中国当代文学。因为中国电影永远离不开文学这根拐杖，看中国电影繁荣与否，首先要看中国文学繁荣与否。中国有好电影，首先要感谢作家们的好小说为电影提供了再创造的可能性。如果拿掉这些小说，中国电影的大部分作品都不会存在。……就我个人而言，我离不开小说。”（2）

时至 21 世纪，莫言刘恒苏童王朔都不再处于各自的创作高峰期了，更谈

understanding. But for Zhang, he could not even afford such an answer, as he wavered between reality and fiction, between truth and lies. He could only find a temporary relief by inserting some laughable elements. (Even the humour in this film is artificial)

This novel by Mo Yan, a rough one, does not come on a par with his representative works, though still within his scope of performance with exact description and understanding of life. But Zhang's film almost is a "misreading" of the novel, if it is still considered an adaptation from the novel. He distorted the black humour into happy tears, but betrayed his weakness in dealing with realistic themes.

THREE

During his honeymoon with contemporary novels, Zhang Yimou once said, "China boasts of large numbers of writers. I am fond of many of them, like Mo Yan, Liu Heng, Su Tong, and Wang Shuo, with whom I have collaborated. Their works, being mother of my films, represent trend of literature as well as films. Therefore if you want to discover the growth of Chinese films or change of my personal style, you can pay attention to the change in those writers." "A research into Chinese contemporary films should begin with study on Chinese contemporary literature, because Chinese films can never live without the support of literature. To know the prosperity of Chinese films, first of all the state of Chinese literature should be examined. The tuning out of good Chinese films should firstly attribute to those writers whose novels provide nourishment for films. Without these novels, most Chinese films would have not existed at all. ...personally I cannot live without novels."

In the 21st century, Mo Yan, Liu Heng, Su Tong, and Wang Shuo, out of the climax of their

不上作为精神导师，引导电影的方向，而扔掉文学这根拐杖的张艺谋，踏上了他拍摄“古装武侠大片”的征程。但电影的繁荣与否，不仅仅在于花去多少投资与赢得多少票房，在于有多少优秀的商业电影与艺术电影，共同构成起多元丰富的电影生态。而“古装武侠大片”系列的《英雄》、《十面埋伏》、《满城尽带黄金甲》，也并不是符合大众意识形态的主流商业片，事实上，它是主导意识形态与不充分市场经济相结合的奇特产物。在对这二者的迎合与利用中，张艺谋找到了另一类型的宏大叙事，对于这类叙事而言，终极理想（《英雄》中的“天下”）与终极权威（《满城尽带黄金甲》中的皇帝）还是需要的，不然无以形成叙事的自洽系统。但这个叙事系统的元素与逻辑都极其简单，重要之处在于对空间的放大与场景的铺张，使电影向着视觉奇观的极端前行。《满城尽带黄金甲》中的视觉奇观，甚至超越了视听感官享受的意义，成为形而上的直接象征——从这个角度上说，张艺谋的形式主义，在此达到了颠峰状态。

这样的电影，是“好电影”吗？离开了文学，他到底是另辟了光明大道，还是走向了死胡同？回顾《红高粱》直到《活着》这几部电影，可以发现，小说——好小说，给张艺谋提供的是一种对历史与现实的洞察力，隐藏着的反思与质疑的能力。但随着文学的边缘化，张艺谋与他的电影，渐次成为主导意识形态/畸形市场状态的合作者，并且是最早的，最成功的合作者，陈凯歌，冯小刚，都远不及他反应敏捷、操作漂亮。这时候的张艺谋，

creation respectively, could not guide films as their spiritual leader. Zhang Yimou, without the support of the crutch of literature, embarked on a journey shooting “Chinese ancient costume and martial arts blockbusters.” However, the prosperity of a film industry cannot be measured by the investment and box office performance alone, but rather, it lies also in how many outstanding commercial films and art films being produced to jointly create a diversified film ecology. *Hero*, *House of Flying Daggers*, *Curse of the Golden Flower* all fall into this category. They are not mainstream commercial films in conformity with popular ideology, but odd products of dominant ideology and underdeveloped market economy, to cater for and take advantage of which Zhang found another way of narration. For this kind of narration, ultimate ideal (“the empire” in *Hero*) and ultimate authority (emperor in *Curse of the Golden Flower*) are necessary to form consistency within itself. But the narration, simple in its elements and logic, lays emphasis on the extension of space and setting, leading the film to go to extremes in terms of visual effects. Visual wonders created in *Curse of the Golden Flower*, overtaking the pleasure of watching and hearing it, turn to be a metaphysical symbol. From this perspective Zhang’s formalism reached its prime at this time.

Are such films “good films”? Breaking up with literature, did he take to a bright road or walk toward an impasse? Looking back at films from *Red Sorghum* to *To Live*, it can be noted that novels—good novels endowed Zhang insight into history and reality as well as capacity to reflect and suspect. As literature was marginalized, Zhang and his films gradually fell into partnership with dominant ideology/deformed market. He took the earliest and most successful step in this direction, far quick-witted and deft than Chen Kaige and Feng

<p>不再需要小说了，他的编剧大体上也只是执笔者，但问题依然存在：他本身与听命于他的编剧，写不出好故事，《英雄》、《十面埋伏》都因为情节遭人诟病，这事实上不仅仅是叙事能力的问题，而是叙事目的与叙事态度，本身也带来对故事的伤害。</p>	<p>Xiaogang. Zhang Yimou of this time did not need novels any more; his screenwriters were also the original writers. But the question is: he himself and the screenwriters at his service could not come up with good stories. Both <i>Hero</i> and <i>House of Flying Daggers</i> were under attack for their plot. It is not a matter of their ability of story-telling, but their purpose and attitude brought detriment to the story.</p>
<p>及至拍摄《满城尽带黄金甲》，张艺谋返过身去，在现代戏剧名著中找到《雷雨》作为蓝本，只是调整了时代与场景的设置。反封建/反压迫的主题保留了下来，但在换了时空后，《雷雨》扭曲变形，电影的语言与主题形成了对峙，在排山倒海的丰乳、士兵与菊花之后，反压迫的主题被反攻得岌岌可危，因为压迫者成了一个不可战胜的象征。这正是《满城尽带黄金甲》的吊诡之处，形式与内容分裂到极点，里芬斯塔尔式的电影语言，被用来讲述一个启蒙故事。当然当文本形成之后，所谓形式与内容不可能二分，依然还是一体的，它于是成为当代语境所混合着的强大的主导意识形态，依然被需要着同时流连不去的启蒙意识形态与消费主义意识形态的同构体，成为所有“古装武侠大片”中最可从不同角度去感受与理解的一部。</p>	<p>In shooting <i>Curse of the Golden Flower</i>, Zhang returned to a masterpiece of modern drama <i>Thunderstorm</i> by Cao Yu for blueprint, but transported it to a different time and place. After such a change is made, though the theme of anti-feudalism/anti-oppression is left intact in the deformed <i>Thunderstorm</i>, it contradicts the movie language. Confronted by a flood of images of big breasts, warriors and chrysanthemums, the theme of anti-oppression appears powerless from any attack, for the oppressor has become a symbol of unconquerableness. This is exactly where <i>Curse of the Golden Flower</i> looks bizarre when its form and content split to such extremes that Leni Riefenstahl's film language is used to tell an enlightening story. But unable to separate entirely they still unite as one in a text. It becomes isologues of dominant ideology in the contemporary context and enlightenment ideology and consumption ideology that people are in constant need of, making it possible for the film to be seen and understood from most angles compared with others of its kind.</p>
<p>因此，《满城尽带黄金甲》绝不简单意味着对《大红灯笼高高挂》式的启蒙主义的回归，它只是反映了这一类型电影被迅速挥霍与消耗时，试图从经典作品中寻求资源帮助的急切心态。张艺谋电影与当代小说的关系似乎并没有多少可能“修复”的迹象，但从头看这二十年来二者的自密而疏，自合而分，可以看到的是，在媒</p>	<p>Therefore, <i>Curse of the Golden Flower</i> does not mean a simple return to enlightenment in <i>Raise the Red Lantern</i>. It reflects an eagerness to seek assistance from classics when resources for this kind of films exhaust. Zhang's film does not seem to show signs of “mending” its broken relationship with the contemporary novel, however, looking back into the past two decades when the two have gone from close to distant,</p>

<p>介权力的变迁中，张艺谋电影迅速地把自已从一个受教者调整到指导者的位置时，却损失了自身的思想高度，并且最终还是要去经典作品中寻求思想与情节资源。无论是商业电影与艺术电影，在与文学的互相联系与启发中寻求互惠，都是一种合乎理想与现实的良性态度。</p> <p>注释：</p> <p>（1）莫言，《小说创作与影视表现》，《文史哲》，2/2004。</p> <p>（2）张艺谋，《谈艺录》。湖南出版社 1996 版，P389。</p> <p>苏七七，影评人，书评人，有作品集《声色现场》、《第一感》。浙江传媒学院教师，并于复旦大学中文系博士后流动站进行相关课题研究。</p>	<p>from marriage to divorce, it can be noted that in the shift of media power Zhang's film quickly has transformed itself from an instructee to an instructor at the expense of losing its own ideological independence and having to find inspiration for ideas and plots from classics again. For commercial films or for art films, it would be a right attitude to seek mutual benefit by coming into contact with and finding inspiration from literature, an attitude that caters to both ideal and reality.</p> <p>Note:</p> <p>（1）Mo Yan, <i>Novel Creation, Movie and TV Expression; Journal of Literature, History and Philosophy</i>, 2/2004.</p> <p>（2）Zhang Yimou, <i>Notes on Literature and Art</i>, Hunan Publishing House, P389.</p> <p>Su Qiqi, film and book critic, author of <i>Sounds and Colours in the Scene</i> and <i>First Sense</i>, professor of Zhejiang University of Media and Communications, researcher on relevant subjects at postdoctoral station of Department of Chinese Language and Literature of Fudan University.</p>
--	---